

# Theory of Computation

## Turing machine closure properties

Arjun Chandrasekhar

# Turing Machine Closure Properties

# Turing Machine Closure Properties

- ▶ We have seen that regular languages are closed under complement, union, intersection, concatenation, star, shuffle, ...

# Turing Machine Closure Properties

- ▶ We have seen that regular languages are closed under complement, union, intersection, concatenation, star, shuffle, ...
- ▶ What operations are decidable languages closed under?

# Turing Machine Closure Properties

- ▶ We have seen that regular languages are closed under complement, union, intersection, concatenation, star, shuffle, ...
- ▶ What operations are decidable languages closed under?
- ▶ What operations are recursively enumerable (RE) languages closed under?

# Turing Machines as Java Programs

# Turing Machines as Java Programs

- ▶ For these problems, you can always think of Turing Machines as Java programs

# Turing Machines as Java Programs

- ▶ For these problems, you can always think of Turing Machines as Java programs
  - ▶ Or Python if you prefer!



# Turing Machines as Java Programs

- ▶ For these problems, you can always think of Turing Machines as Java programs
  - ▶ Or Python if you prefer!
  - ▶ Or Haskell if you're streets ahead :)

# Turing Machines as Java Programs

- ▶ For these problems, you can always think of Turing Machines as Java programs
  - ▶ Or Python if you prefer!
  - ▶ Or Haskell if you're streets ahead :)
  - ▶ Or (literally) ANY language

# Turing Machines as Java Programs

- ▶ For these problems, you can always think of Turing Machines as Java programs
  - ▶ Or Python if you prefer!
  - ▶ Or Haskell if you're streets ahead :)
  - ▶ Or (literally) ANY language
- ▶ We don't need tape-level descriptions

# Turing Machines as Java Programs

- ▶ For these problems, you can always think of Turing Machines as Java programs
  - ▶ Or Python if you prefer!
  - ▶ Or Haskell if you're streets ahead :)
  - ▶ Or (literally) ANY language
- ▶ We don't need tape-level descriptions
- ▶ Java programs are algorithms, and algorithms are Turing machines (Church-Turing thesis)

# Closure of Java Programs under Union

# Closure of Java Programs under Union

- ▶ Let's say I have two java programs called `Foo.java`, and `Bar.java`

# Closure of Java Programs under Union

- ▶ Let's say I have two java programs called `Foo.java`, and `Bar.java`
  - ▶ Each program a string  $w$  as input and prints out either ACCEPT or REJECT

# Closure of Java Programs under Union

- ▶ Let's say I have two java programs called `Foo.java`, and `Bar.java`
  - ▶ Each program a string  $w$  as input and prints out either ACCEPT or REJECT
  - ▶ Let's say each program is guaranteed to halt



# Closure of Java Programs under Union

- ▶ Let's say I have two java programs called `Foo.java`, and `Bar.java`
  - ▶ Each program a string  $w$  as input and prints out either ACCEPT or REJECT
  - ▶ Let's say each program is guaranteed to halt
- ▶ How would you write a java program called `FooBar.java` that checks if a string  $w$  is accepted by *either* `Foo.java` or by `Bar.java` (or both)?

# Closure of Java Programs under Union

FooBar.java does the following:

# Closure of Java Programs under Union

FooBar.java does the following:

1. FooBar.java takes  $w$  as input

# Closure of Java Programs under Union

FooBar.java does the following:

1. FooBar.java takes  $w$  as input
2. Run Foo.java and pass  $w$  as the input

# Closure of Java Programs under Union

FooBar.java does the following:

1. FooBar.java takes  $w$  as input
2. Run Foo.java and pass  $w$  as the input
3. Run Bar.java and pass  $w$  as the input

# Closure of Java Programs under Union

`FooBar.java` does the following:

1. `FooBar.java` takes  $w$  as input
2. Run `Foo.java` and pass  $w$  as the input
3. Run `Bar.java` and pass  $w$  as the input
4. If either program prints ACCEPT, then `FooBar.java` prints ACCEPT. Otherwise, it prints REJECT

# Closure of Java Programs under Union

# Closure of Java Programs under Union

- ▶ Let's say I have two java programs called `Foo.java`, and `Bar.java`



# Closure of Java Programs under Union

- ▶ Let's say I have two java programs called `Foo.java`, and `Bar.java`
  - ▶ Each program a string  $w$  as input and prints out either ACCEPT or REJECT

# Closure of Java Programs under Union

- ▶ Let's say I have two java programs called `Foo.java`, and `Bar.java`
  - ▶ Each program a string  $w$  as input and prints out either ACCEPT or REJECT
  - ▶ Now let's assume that either program could go into an infinite loop.

# Closure of Java Programs under Union

- ▶ Let's say I have two java programs called `Foo.java`, and `Bar.java`
  - ▶ Each program a string  $w$  as input and prints out either ACCEPT or REJECT
  - ▶ Now let's assume that either program could go into an infinite loop.
- ▶ How would you write a java program called `FooBar.java` that checks if a string  $w$  is accepted by either `Foo.java` or by `Bar.java` (or both)?

# Closure of Java Programs under Union

FooBar.java does the following:

# Closure of Java Programs under Union

FooBar.java does the following:

1. FooBar.java takes  $w$  as input

# Closure of Java Programs under Union

FooBar.java does the following:

1. FooBar.java takes  $w$  as input
2. Run Foo.java and pass  $w$  as the input

# Closure of Java Programs under Union

FooBar.java does the following:

1. FooBar.java takes  $w$  as input
2. Run Foo.java and pass  $w$  as the input
3. Run Bar.java and pass  $w$  as the input

# Closure of Java Programs under Union

`FooBar.java` does the following:

1. `FooBar.java` takes  $w$  as input
2. Run `Foo.java` and pass  $w$  as the input
3. Run `Bar.java` and pass  $w$  as the input
4. If either program prints ACCEPT, then `FooBar.java` prints ACCEPT. Otherwise, it prints REJECT



# Closure of Java Programs under Union

`FooBar.java` does the following:

1. `FooBar.java` takes  $w$  as input
2. Run `Foo.java` and pass  $w$  as the input
3. Run `Bar.java` and pass  $w$  as the input
4. If either program prints ACCEPT, then `FooBar.java` prints ACCEPT. Otherwise, it prints REJECT

Will this work?

# Closure of Java Programs under Union

FooBar.java does the following:

1. FooBar.java takes  $w$  as input
2. ~~Run Foo.java and pass  $w$  as the input~~  
This might loop, and we'll never get to run Bar!
3. Run Bar.java and pass  $w$  as the input
4. If either program prints ACCEPT, then FooBar.java prints ACCEPT. Otherwise, it prints REJECT

Will this work?

# Closure of Java Programs under Union

FooBar.java does the following:

1. FooBar.java takes  $w$  as input

# Closure of Java Programs under Union

FooBar.java does the following:

1. FooBar.java takes  $w$  as input
2. Run Foo.java and Bar.java in parallel

# Closure of Java Programs under Union

FooBar.java does the following:

1. FooBar.java takes  $w$  as input
2. Run Foo.java and Bar.java in parallel
  - ▶ Use some sort of timer to let the machines take turns running

# Closure of Java Programs under Union

FooBar.java does the following:

1. FooBar.java takes  $w$  as input
2. Run Foo.java and Bar.java in parallel
  - ▶ Use some sort of timer to let the machines take turns running
3. If either program ever prints out ACCEPT, then FooBar.java prints ACCEPT.

# Closure of Java Programs under Union

FooBar.java does the following:

1. FooBar.java takes  $w$  as input
2. Run Foo.java and Bar.java in parallel
  - ▶ Use some sort of timer to let the machines take turns running
3. If either program ever prints out ACCEPT, then FooBar.java prints ACCEPT.
4. If both print REJECT, FooBar.java prints REJECT.

# Closure of Java Programs under Union

`FooBar.java` does the following:

1. `FooBar.java` takes  $w$  as input
2. Run `Foo.java` and `Bar.java` in parallel
  - ▶ Use some sort of timer to let the machines take turns running
3. If either program ever prints out ACCEPT, then `FooBar.java` prints ACCEPT.
4. If both print REJECT, `FooBar.java` prints REJECT.
5. Otherwise `FooBar.java` runs forever.



# Closure of Decidable Languages under Union

# Closure of Decidable Languages under Union

Let's prove that decidable languages are closed under union

# Closure of Decidable Languages under Union

Let's prove that decidable languages are closed under union

- ▶ Want to show that if  $A$  and  $B$  are decidable, then  $A \cup B$  is decidable

# Closure of Decidable Languages under Union

Suppose  $A$  and  $B$  are decidable

# Closure of Decidable Languages under Union

Suppose  $A$  and  $B$  are decidable

- ▶ There are machines  $M_A, M_B$  that decide  $A$  and  $B$

# Closure of Decidable Languages under Union

Suppose  $A$  and  $B$  are decidable

- ▶ There are machines  $M_A, M_B$  that decide  $A$  and  $B$
- ▶ Create a machine  $M$  to decide  $A \cup B$

# Closure of Decidable Languages under Union

Suppose  $A$  and  $B$  are decidable

- ▶ There are machines  $M_A, M_B$  that decide  $A$  and  $B$
- ▶ Create a machine  $M$  to decide  $A \cup B$
- ▶  $M$  does the following on input  $w$ :

# Closure of Decidable Languages under Union

Suppose  $A$  and  $B$  are decidable

- ▶ There are machines  $M_A, M_B$  that decide  $A$  and  $B$
- ▶ Create a machine  $M$  to decide  $A \cup B$
- ▶  $M$  does the following on input  $w$ :
  1. Run  $M_A$  on  $w$



# Closure of Decidable Languages under Union

Suppose  $A$  and  $B$  are decidable

- ▶ There are machines  $M_A, M_B$  that decide  $A$  and  $B$
- ▶ Create a machine  $M$  to decide  $A \cup B$
- ▶  $M$  does the following on input  $w$ :
  1. Run  $M_A$  on  $w$
  2. Run  $M_B$  on  $w$

# Closure of Decidable Languages under Union

Suppose  $A$  and  $B$  are decidable

- ▶ There are machines  $M_A, M_B$  that decide  $A$  and  $B$
- ▶ Create a machine  $M$  to decide  $A \cup B$
- ▶  $M$  does the following on input  $w$ :
  1. Run  $M_A$  on  $w$
  2. Run  $M_B$  on  $w$
  3. If either machine accepts,  $M$  accepts. Otherwise,  $M$  rejects

# Closure of RE Languages under Union

# Closure of RE Languages under Union

Let's prove that RE languages are closed under union

# Closure of RE Languages under Union

Let's prove that RE languages are closed under union

- ▶ Want to show if  $A$  and  $B$  are RE, then  $A \cup B$  is RE

# Closure of RE Languages under Union

Suppose  $A$  and  $B$  are RE

# Closure of RE Languages under Union

Suppose  $A$  and  $B$  are RE

- ▶ There are machines  $M_A, M_B$  that recognize  $A$  and  $B$

# Closure of RE Languages under Union

Suppose  $A$  and  $B$  are RE

- ▶ There are machines  $M_A, M_B$  that recognize  $A$  and  $B$
- ▶ Create a machine  $M$  to recognize  $A \cup B$



# Closure of RE Languages under Union

Suppose  $A$  and  $B$  are RE

- ▶ There are machines  $M_A, M_B$  that recognize  $A$  and  $B$
- ▶ Create a machine  $M$  to recognize  $A \cup B$
- ▶  $M$  does the following on input  $w$ :

# Closure of RE Languages under Union

Suppose  $A$  and  $B$  are RE

- ▶ There are machines  $M_A, M_B$  that recognize  $A$  and  $B$
- ▶ Create a machine  $M$  to recognize  $A \cup B$
- ▶  $M$  does the following on input  $w$ :
  1. Run  $M_A$  on  $w$

# Closure of RE Languages under Union

Suppose  $A$  and  $B$  are RE

- ▶ There are machines  $M_A, M_B$  that recognize  $A$  and  $B$
- ▶ Create a machine  $M$  to recognize  $A \cup B$
- ▶  $M$  does the following on input  $w$ :
  1. Run  $M_A$  on  $w$
  2. Run  $M_B$  on  $w$

# Closure of RE Languages under Union

Suppose  $A$  and  $B$  are RE

- ▶ There are machines  $M_A, M_B$  that recognize  $A$  and  $B$
- ▶ Create a machine  $M$  to recognize  $A \cup B$
- ▶  $M$  does the following on input  $w$ :
  1. Run  $M_A$  on  $w$
  2. Run  $M_B$  on  $w$
  3. If either machine accepts,  $M$  accepts. Otherwise,  $M$  rejects

# Closure of RE Languages under Union

Suppose  $A$  and  $B$  are RE

- ▶ There are machines  $M_A, M_B$  that recognize  $A$  and  $B$
- ▶ Create a machine  $M$  to recognize  $A \cup B$
- ▶  $M$  does the following on input  $w$ :
  1. Run  $M_A$  on  $w$
  2. Run  $M_B$  on  $w$
  3. If either machine accepts,  $M$  accepts. Otherwise,  $M$  rejects

Will this work?

# Closure of RE Languages under Union

Suppose  $A$  and  $B$  are RE

- ▶ There are machines  $M_A, M_B$  that recognize  $A$  and  $B$
- ▶ Create a machine  $M$  to recognize  $A \cup B$
- ▶  $M$  does the following on input  $w$ :
  1. ~~Run  $M_A$  on  $w$~~   
This might loop forever!
  2. Run  $M_B$  on  $w$
  3. If either machine accepts,  $M$  accepts. Otherwise,  $M$  rejects

Will this work?

# Closure of RE Languages under Union

Suppose  $A$  and  $B$  are RE

- ▶ There are machines  $M_A, M_B$  that recognize  $A$  and  $B$

# Closure of RE Languages under Union

Suppose  $A$  and  $B$  are RE

- ▶ There are machines  $M_A, M_B$  that recognize  $A$  and  $B$
- ▶ Create a machine  $M$  to recognize  $A \cup B$



# Closure of RE Languages under Union

Suppose  $A$  and  $B$  are RE

- ▶ There are machines  $M_A, M_B$  that recognize  $A$  and  $B$
- ▶ Create a machine  $M$  to recognize  $A \cup B$
- ▶  $M$  does the following on input  $w$ :

# Closure of RE Languages under Union

Suppose  $A$  and  $B$  are RE

- ▶ There are machines  $M_A, M_B$  that recognize  $A$  and  $B$
- ▶ Create a machine  $M$  to recognize  $A \cup B$
- ▶  $M$  does the following on input  $w$ :
  1. Run  $M_A$  and  $M_B$  in parallel

# Closure of RE Languages under Union

Suppose  $A$  and  $B$  are RE

- ▶ There are machines  $M_A, M_B$  that recognize  $A$  and  $B$
- ▶ Create a machine  $M$  to recognize  $A \cup B$
- ▶  $M$  does the following on input  $w$ :
  1. Run  $M_A$  and  $M_B$  in parallel
    - 1.1 Run  $M_A$  for one step

# Closure of RE Languages under Union

Suppose  $A$  and  $B$  are RE

- ▶ There are machines  $M_A, M_B$  that recognize  $A$  and  $B$
- ▶ Create a machine  $M$  to recognize  $A \cup B$
- ▶  $M$  does the following on input  $w$ :
  1. Run  $M_A$  and  $M_B$  in parallel
    - 1.1 Run  $M_A$  for one step
    - 1.2 Run  $M_B$  for one step

# Closure of RE Languages under Union

Suppose  $A$  and  $B$  are RE

- ▶ There are machines  $M_A, M_B$  that recognize  $A$  and  $B$
- ▶ Create a machine  $M$  to recognize  $A \cup B$
- ▶  $M$  does the following on input  $w$ :
  1. Run  $M_A$  and  $M_B$  in parallel
    - 1.1 Run  $M_A$  for one step
    - 1.2 Run  $M_B$  for one step
    - 1.3 Run  $M_A$  for one step

# Closure of RE Languages under Union

Suppose  $A$  and  $B$  are RE

- ▶ There are machines  $M_A, M_B$  that recognize  $A$  and  $B$
- ▶ Create a machine  $M$  to recognize  $A \cup B$
- ▶  $M$  does the following on input  $w$ :
  1. Run  $M_A$  and  $M_B$  in parallel
    - 1.1 Run  $M_A$  for one step
    - 1.2 Run  $M_B$  for one step
    - 1.3 Run  $M_A$  for one step
    - 1.4 Run  $M_B$  for one step

# Closure of RE Languages under Union

Suppose  $A$  and  $B$  are RE

- ▶ There are machines  $M_A, M_B$  that recognize  $A$  and  $B$
- ▶ Create a machine  $M$  to recognize  $A \cup B$
- ▶  $M$  does the following on input  $w$ :
  1. Run  $M_A$  and  $M_B$  in parallel
    - 1.1 Run  $M_A$  for one step
    - 1.2 Run  $M_B$  for one step
    - 1.3 Run  $M_A$  for one step
    - 1.4 Run  $M_B$  for one step
    - 1.5 ...

# Closure of RE Languages under Union

Suppose  $A$  and  $B$  are RE

- ▶ There are machines  $M_A, M_B$  that recognize  $A$  and  $B$
- ▶ Create a machine  $M$  to recognize  $A \cup B$
- ▶  $M$  does the following on input  $w$ :
  1. Run  $M_A$  and  $M_B$  in parallel
    - 1.1 Run  $M_A$  for one step
    - 1.2 Run  $M_B$  for one step
    - 1.3 Run  $M_A$  for one step
    - 1.4 Run  $M_B$  for one step
    - 1.5 ...
  2. If either  $M_A$  or  $M_B$  (ever) accepts, then  $M$  accepts



# Closure of RE Languages under Union

Suppose  $A$  and  $B$  are RE

- ▶ There are machines  $M_A, M_B$  that recognize  $A$  and  $B$
- ▶ Create a machine  $M$  to recognize  $A \cup B$
- ▶  $M$  does the following on input  $w$ :
  1. Run  $M_A$  and  $M_B$  in parallel
    - 1.1 Run  $M_A$  for one step
    - 1.2 Run  $M_B$  for one step
    - 1.3 Run  $M_A$  for one step
    - 1.4 Run  $M_B$  for one step
    - 1.5 ...
  2. If either  $M_A$  or  $M_B$  (ever) accepts, then  $M$  accepts
  3. If neither machine (ever) accepts, then  $M$  will never accept - which is sufficient

# Closure of RE Languages under Union

Suppose  $A$  and  $B$  are RE

- ▶ There are machines  $M_A, M_B$  that recognize  $A$  and  $B$

# Closure of RE Languages under Union

Suppose  $A$  and  $B$  are RE

- ▶ There are machines  $M_A, M_B$  that recognize  $A$  and  $B$
- ▶ Create a nondeterministic machine  $M$  to recognize  $A \cup B$

# Closure of RE Languages under Union

Suppose  $A$  and  $B$  are RE

- ▶ There are machines  $M_A, M_B$  that recognize  $A$  and  $B$
- ▶ Create a nondeterministic machine  $M$  to recognize  $A \cup B$
- ▶  $M$  does the following on input  $w$ :

# Closure of RE Languages under Union

Suppose  $A$  and  $B$  are RE

- ▶ There are machines  $M_A, M_B$  that recognize  $A$  and  $B$
- ▶ Create a nondeterministic machine  $M$  to recognize  $A \cup B$
- ▶  $M$  does the following on input  $w$ :
  1. On input  $w$ , nondeterministically guess whether to  $w \in A$  or  $w \in B$

# Closure of RE Languages under Union

Suppose  $A$  and  $B$  are RE

- ▶ There are machines  $M_A, M_B$  that recognize  $A$  and  $B$
- ▶ Create a nondeterministic machine  $M$  to recognize  $A \cup B$
- ▶  $M$  does the following on input  $w$ :
  1. On input  $w$ , nondeterministically guess whether to  $w \in A$  or  $w \in B$
  2. Either run  $M_A$  or  $M_B$ , depending on which language you guessed

# Closure of RE Languages under Union

Suppose  $A$  and  $B$  are RE

- ▶ There are machines  $M_A, M_B$  that recognize  $A$  and  $B$
- ▶ Create a nondeterministic machine  $M$  to recognize  $A \cup B$
- ▶  $M$  does the following on input  $w$ :
  1. On input  $w$ , nondeterministically guess whether to  $w \in A$  or  $w \in B$
  2. Either run  $M_A$  or  $M_B$ , depending on which language you guessed
  3. If the guessed machine accepts  $M$  will accept

# Closure of RE Languages under Union

Suppose  $A$  and  $B$  are RE

- ▶ There are machines  $M_A, M_B$  that recognize  $A$  and  $B$
- ▶ Create a nondeterministic machine  $M$  to recognize  $A \cup B$
- ▶  $M$  does the following on input  $w$ :
  1. On input  $w$ , nondeterministically guess whether to  $w \in A$  or  $w \in B$
  2. Either run  $M_A$  or  $M_B$ , depending on which language you guessed
  3. If the guessed machine accepts  $M$  will accept
  4. If neither machine accepts,  $M$  will not accept no matter how it guesses (which is sufficient)



# Closure of RE Languages under Union

Suppose  $A$  and  $B$  are RE

- ▶ There are machines  $M_A, M_B$  that recognize  $A$  and  $B$
- ▶ Create a nondeterministic machine  $M$  to recognize  $A \cup B$
- ▶  $M$  does the following on input  $w$ :
  1. On input  $w$ , nondeterministically guess whether to  $w \in A$  or  $w \in B$
  2. Either run  $M_A$  or  $M_B$ , depending on which language you guessed
  3. If the guessed machine accepts  $M$  will accept
  4. If neither machine accepts,  $M$  will not accept no matter how it guesses (which is sufficient)
- ▶ Every nondeterministic TM can be converted to a deterministic TM

# Closure Properties of Turing Machines

- ▶ Prove that decidable languages are closed under intersection
- ▶ Prove that RE languages are closed under intersection

# Closure of Decidable Languages under Intersection

- ▶ Suppose  $A$  and  $B$  are decidable

# Closure of Decidable Languages under Intersection

- ▶ Suppose  $A$  and  $B$  are decidable
- ▶ Let  $M_A$  and  $M_B$  decide  $A$  and  $B$ , respectively

# Closure of Decidable Languages under Intersection

- ▶ Suppose  $A$  and  $B$  are decidable
- ▶ Let  $M_A$  and  $M_B$  decide  $A$  and  $B$ , respectively
- ▶ We construct a machine  $M$  to decide  $A \cap B$

# Closure of Decidable Languages under Intersection

- ▶ Suppose  $A$  and  $B$  are decidable
- ▶ Let  $M_A$  and  $M_B$  decide  $A$  and  $B$ , respectively
- ▶ We construct a machine  $M$  to decide  $A \cap B$
- ▶  $M$  does the following:

# Closure of Decidable Languages under Intersection

- ▶ Suppose  $A$  and  $B$  are decidable
- ▶ Let  $M_A$  and  $M_B$  decide  $A$  and  $B$ , respectively
- ▶ We construct a machine  $M$  to decide  $A \cap B$
- ▶  $M$  does the following:
  1.  $M$  takes  $w$  as input

# Closure of Decidable Languages under Intersection

- ▶ Suppose  $A$  and  $B$  are decidable
- ▶ Let  $M_A$  and  $M_B$  decide  $A$  and  $B$ , respectively
- ▶ We construct a machine  $M$  to decide  $A \cap B$
- ▶  $M$  does the following:
  1.  $M$  takes  $w$  as input
  2. Run  $M_A$  on  $w$



# Closure of Decidable Languages under Intersection

- ▶ Suppose  $A$  and  $B$  are decidable
- ▶ Let  $M_A$  and  $M_B$  decide  $A$  and  $B$ , respectively
- ▶ We construct a machine  $M$  to decide  $A \cap B$
- ▶  $M$  does the following:
  1.  $M$  takes  $w$  as input
  2. Run  $M_A$  on  $w$
  3. Run  $M_B$  on  $w$

# Closure of Decidable Languages under Intersection

- ▶ Suppose  $A$  and  $B$  are decidable
- ▶ Let  $M_A$  and  $M_B$  decide  $A$  and  $B$ , respectively
- ▶ We construct a machine  $M$  to decide  $A \cap B$
- ▶  $M$  does the following:
  1.  $M$  takes  $w$  as input
  2. Run  $M_A$  on  $w$
  3. Run  $M_B$  on  $w$
  4. If  $M_A$  and  $M_B$  both accept  $w$ , then  $M$  accepts  $w$

# Closure of Decidable Languages under Intersection

- ▶ Suppose  $A$  and  $B$  are decidable
- ▶ Let  $M_A$  and  $M_B$  decide  $A$  and  $B$ , respectively
- ▶ We construct a machine  $M$  to decide  $A \cap B$
- ▶  $M$  does the following:
  1.  $M$  takes  $w$  as input
  2. Run  $M_A$  on  $w$
  3. Run  $M_B$  on  $w$
  4. If  $M_A$  and  $M_B$  both accept  $w$ , then  $M$  accepts  $w$
  5. If either machine rejects, then  $M$  rejects

# Closure of RE Languages under Intersection

- ▶ Suppose  $A$  and  $B$  are RE

# Closure of RE Languages under Intersection

- ▶ Suppose  $A$  and  $B$  are RE
- ▶ Let  $M_A$  and  $M_B$  recognize  $A$  and  $B$ , respectively

# Closure of RE Languages under Intersection

- ▶ Suppose  $A$  and  $B$  are RE
- ▶ Let  $M_A$  and  $M_B$  recognize  $A$  and  $B$ , respectively
- ▶ We construct a machine  $M$  to recognize  $A \cap B$

# Closure of RE Languages under Intersection

- ▶ Suppose  $A$  and  $B$  are RE
- ▶ Let  $M_A$  and  $M_B$  recognize  $A$  and  $B$ , respectively
- ▶ We construct a machine  $M$  to recognize  $A \cap B$
- ▶  $M$  does the following:

# Closure of RE Languages under Intersection

- ▶ Suppose  $A$  and  $B$  are RE
- ▶ Let  $M_A$  and  $M_B$  recognize  $A$  and  $B$ , respectively
- ▶ We construct a machine  $M$  to recognize  $A \cap B$
- ▶  $M$  does the following:
  1.  $M$  takes  $w$  as input



# Closure of RE Languages under Intersection

- ▶ Suppose  $A$  and  $B$  are RE
- ▶ Let  $M_A$  and  $M_B$  recognize  $A$  and  $B$ , respectively
- ▶ We construct a machine  $M$  to recognize  $A \cap B$
- ▶  $M$  does the following:
  1.  $M$  takes  $w$  as input
  2. Run  $M_A$  and  $M_B$  in parallel on  $w$

# Closure of RE Languages under Intersection

- ▶ Suppose  $A$  and  $B$  are RE
- ▶ Let  $M_A$  and  $M_B$  recognize  $A$  and  $B$ , respectively
- ▶ We construct a machine  $M$  to recognize  $A \cap B$
- ▶  $M$  does the following:
  1.  $M$  takes  $w$  as input
  2. Run  $M_A$  and  $M_B$  in parallel on  $w$
  3. If  $M_A$  and  $M_B$  both accept,  $M$  accepts  $w$

# Closure of RE Languages under Intersection

- ▶ Suppose  $A$  and  $B$  are RE
- ▶ Let  $M_A$  and  $M_B$  recognize  $A$  and  $B$ , respectively
- ▶ We construct a machine  $M$  to recognize  $A \cap B$
- ▶  $M$  does the following:
  1.  $M$  takes  $w$  as input
  2. Run  $M_A$  and  $M_B$  in parallel on  $w$
  3. If  $M_A$  and  $M_B$  both accept,  $M$  accepts  $w$
  4. If  $w \notin A \cap B$  then  $M$  might loop forever but that's ok

# Closure Properties of Turing Machines

For any language  $A$ , let

$$\#(A) = \{w = w_1\#w_2\#\dots\#w_n \mid w_i \in A\}$$

i.e. several strings in  $A$  each separated by a  $\#$  sign

# Closure Properties of Turing Machines

For any language  $A$ , let

$$\#(A) = \{w = w_1\#w_2\#\dots\#w_n \mid w_i \in A\}$$

i.e. several strings in  $A$  each separated by a  $\#$  sign

- ▶ Prove that decidable languages are closed under  $\#$
- ▶ Prove that RE languages are closed under  $\#$

# Closure of Decidable Languages under #

# Closure of Decidable Languages under $\#$

- ▶ Suppose  $A$  is decidable

# Closure of Decidable Languages under $\#$

- ▶ Suppose  $A$  is decidable
- ▶ Let  $M_A$  decide  $A$



# Closure of Decidable Languages under $\#$

- ▶ Suppose  $A$  is decidable
- ▶ Let  $M_A$  decide  $A$
- ▶ Create a machine  $M$  to decide  $\#(A)$ .

# Closure of Decidable Languages under $\#$

- ▶ Suppose  $A$  is decidable
- ▶ Let  $M_A$  decide  $A$
- ▶ Create a machine  $M$  to decide  $\#(A)$ .
- ▶  $M$  does the following:

# Closure of Decidable Languages under $\#$

- ▶ Suppose  $A$  is decidable
- ▶ Let  $M_A$  decide  $A$
- ▶ Create a machine  $M$  to decide  $\#(A)$ .
- ▶  $M$  does the following:
  1.  $M$  takes  $w$  as input

# Closure of Decidable Languages under $\#$

- ▶ Suppose  $A$  is decidable
- ▶ Let  $M_A$  decide  $A$
- ▶ Create a machine  $M$  to decide  $\#(A)$ .
- ▶  $M$  does the following:
  1.  $M$  takes  $w$  as input
  2. Check that  $w = w_1\#w_2\dots\#w_n$  (i.e. correct format)

# Closure of Decidable Languages under $\#$

- ▶ Suppose  $A$  is decidable
- ▶ Let  $M_A$  decide  $A$
- ▶ Create a machine  $M$  to decide  $\#(A)$ .
- ▶  $M$  does the following:
  1.  $M$  takes  $w$  as input
  2. Check that  $w = w_1\#w_2\dots\#w_n$  (i.e. correct format)
  3. Run  $M_A$  on each  $w_i$

# Closure of Decidable Languages under $\#$

- ▶ Suppose  $A$  is decidable
- ▶ Let  $M_A$  decide  $A$
- ▶ Create a machine  $M$  to decide  $\#(A)$ .
- ▶  $M$  does the following:
  1.  $M$  takes  $w$  as input
  2. Check that  $w = w_1\#w_2\dots\#w_n$  (i.e. correct format)
  3. Run  $M_A$  on each  $w_i$
  4. If  $M_A$  accepts each  $w_i$  accept. Otherwise, reject

# Closure of RE Languages under #

# Closure of RE Languages under #

- ▶ Suppose  $A$  is RE



# Closure of RE Languages under #

- ▶ Suppose  $A$  is RE
- ▶ Let  $M_A$  recognize  $A$

# Closure of RE Languages under #

- ▶ Suppose  $A$  is RE
- ▶ Let  $M_A$  recognize  $A$
- ▶ Create a machine  $M$  to recognize  $\#(A)$

# Closure of RE Languages under $\#$

- ▶ Suppose  $A$  is RE
- ▶ Let  $M_A$  recognize  $A$
- ▶ Create a machine  $M$  to recognize  $\#(A)$
- ▶  $M$  does the following:

# Closure of RE Languages under $\#$

- ▶ Suppose  $A$  is RE
- ▶ Let  $M_A$  recognize  $A$
- ▶ Create a machine  $M$  to recognize  $\#(A)$
- ▶  $M$  does the following:
  1.  $M$  takes  $w$  as input

# Closure of RE Languages under $\#$

- ▶ Suppose  $A$  is RE
- ▶ Let  $M_A$  recognize  $A$
- ▶ Create a machine  $M$  to recognize  $\#(A)$
- ▶  $M$  does the following:
  1.  $M$  takes  $w$  as input
  2. Check that  $w = w_1\#w_2\dots\#w_n$  (i.e. correct format)

# Closure of RE Languages under #

- ▶ Suppose  $A$  is RE
- ▶ Let  $M_A$  recognize  $A$
- ▶ Create a machine  $M$  to recognize  $\#(A)$
- ▶  $M$  does the following:
  1.  $M$  takes  $w$  as input
  2. Check that  $w = w_1\#w_2\dots\#w_n$  (i.e. correct format)
  3. Run  $M_A$  in parallel on each  $w_i$

# Closure of RE Languages under $\#$

- ▶ Suppose  $A$  is RE
- ▶ Let  $M_A$  recognize  $A$
- ▶ Create a machine  $M$  to recognize  $\#(A)$
- ▶  $M$  does the following:
  1.  $M$  takes  $w$  as input
  2. Check that  $w = w_1\#w_2\dots\#w_n$  (i.e. correct format)
  3. Run  $M_A$  in parallel on each  $w_i$
  4. If  $M_A$  accepts each  $w_i$ , then  $M$  accepts  $w$ .

# Closure of RE Languages under #

- ▶ Suppose  $A$  is RE
- ▶ Let  $M_A$  recognize  $A$
- ▶ Create a machine  $M$  to recognize  $\#(A)$
- ▶  $M$  does the following:
  1.  $M$  takes  $w$  as input
  2. Check that  $w = w_1\#w_2\dots\#w_n$  (i.e. correct format)
  3. Run  $M_A$  in parallel on each  $w_i$
  4. If  $M_A$  accepts each  $w_i$ , then  $M$  accepts  $w$ .
  5. If any  $w_i \notin A$  then  $M$  may loop forever, and that's ok



# Closure Properties of Turing Machines

Recall that for any language  $A$ , let

$$A^* = \{w = w_1w_2 \dots w_n \mid w_i \in A\}$$

# Closure Properties of Turing Machines

Recall that for any language  $A$ , let

$$A^* = \{w = w_1w_2 \dots w_n \mid w_i \in A\}$$

- ▶ Prove that decidable languages are closed under Kleene star
- ▶ Prove that RE languages are closed under Kleene star

# Closure of Decidable Languages under Kleene Star

# Closure of Decidable Languages under Kleene Star

- ▶ Suppose  $A$  is decidable

# Closure of Decidable Languages under Kleene Star

- ▶ Suppose  $A$  is decidable
- ▶ Let  $M_A$  decide  $A$

# Closure of Decidable Languages under Kleene Star

- ▶ Suppose  $A$  is decidable
- ▶ Let  $M_A$  decide  $A$
- ▶ Create a machine  $M$  to decide  $A^*$

# Closure of Decidable Languages under Kleene Star

- ▶ Suppose  $A$  is decidable
- ▶ Let  $M_A$  decide  $A$
- ▶ Create a machine  $M$  to decide  $A^*$
- ▶  $M$  does the following:

# Closure of Decidable Languages under Kleene Star

- ▶ Suppose  $A$  is decidable
- ▶ Let  $M_A$  decide  $A$
- ▶ Create a machine  $M$  to decide  $A^*$
- ▶  $M$  does the following:
  1.  $M$  takes  $w$  as input



# Closure of Decidable Languages under Kleene Star

- ▶ Suppose  $A$  is decidable
- ▶ Let  $M_A$  decide  $A$
- ▶ Create a machine  $M$  to decide  $A^*$
- ▶  $M$  does the following:
  1.  $M$  takes  $w$  as input
  2. Try all possible ways of splitting up  $w = w_1 w_2 \dots w_n$

Try all possible ways of splitting up  $w$

Split 1:  $w \mid w \mid w \mid w \mid w \mid w \mid w \dots$

Split 2:  $w \ w \ w \ w \mid w \ w \mid w \dots$

Split 3:  $w \mid w \ w \mid w \ w \mid w \ w \dots$

Split 4:  $w \mid w \ w \ w \ w \ w \ w \dots$

# Closure of Decidable Languages under Kleene Star

- ▶ Suppose  $A$  is decidable
- ▶ Let  $M_A$  decide  $A$
- ▶ Create a machine  $M$  to decide  $A^*$
- ▶  $M$  does the following:
  1.  $M$  takes  $w$  as input
  2. Try all possible ways of splitting up  $w = w_1 w_2 \dots w_n$ 
    - 2.1 For each way of splitting it up, run  $M_A$  on each  $w_i$

# Closure of Decidable Languages under Kleene Star

- ▶ Suppose  $A$  is decidable
- ▶ Let  $M_A$  decide  $A$
- ▶ Create a machine  $M$  to decide  $A^*$
- ▶  $M$  does the following:
  1.  $M$  takes  $w$  as input
  2. Try all possible ways of splitting up  $w = w_1 w_2 \dots w_n$ 
    - 2.1 For each way of splitting it up, run  $M_A$  on each  $w_i$
    - 2.2 If  $M_A$  accepts each  $w_i$ , then  $M$  accepts

# Closure of Decidable Languages under Kleene Star

- ▶ Suppose  $A$  is decidable
- ▶ Let  $M_A$  decide  $A$
- ▶ Create a machine  $M$  to decide  $A^*$
- ▶  $M$  does the following:
  1.  $M$  takes  $w$  as input
  2. Try all possible ways of splitting up  $w = w_1 w_2 \dots w_n$ 
    - 2.1 For each way of splitting it up, run  $M_A$  on each  $w_i$
    - 2.2 If  $M_A$  accepts each  $w_i$ , then  $M$  accepts
    - 2.3 Otherwise move on to the next way of splitting up  $w$

# Closure of Decidable Languages under Kleene Star

- ▶ Suppose  $A$  is decidable
- ▶ Let  $M_A$  decide  $A$
- ▶ Create a machine  $M$  to decide  $A^*$
- ▶  $M$  does the following:
  1.  $M$  takes  $w$  as input
  2. Try all possible ways of splitting up  $w = w_1 w_2 \dots w_n$ 
    - 2.1 For each way of splitting it up, run  $M_A$  on each  $w_i$
    - 2.2 If  $M_A$  accepts each  $w_i$ , then  $M$  accepts
    - 2.3 Otherwise move on to the next way of splitting up  $w$
  3. If all splits are rejected, then  $M$  rejects

# Closure of RE Languages under Kleene Star

# Closure of RE Languages under Kleene Star

- ▶ Suppose  $A$  is RE



# Closure of RE Languages under Kleene Star

- ▶ Suppose  $A$  is RE
- ▶ Let  $M_A$  recognize  $A$

# Closure of RE Languages under Kleene Star

- ▶ Suppose  $A$  is RE
- ▶ Let  $M_A$  recognize  $A$
- ▶ Create a machine  $M$  to recognize  $A^*$ .

# Closure of RE Languages under Kleene Star

- ▶ Suppose  $A$  is RE
- ▶ Let  $M_A$  recognize  $A$
- ▶ Create a machine  $M$  to recognize  $A^*$ .
- ▶  $M$  does the following:

# Closure of RE Languages under Kleene Star

- ▶ Suppose  $A$  is RE
- ▶ Let  $M_A$  recognize  $A$
- ▶ Create a machine  $M$  to recognize  $A^*$ .
- ▶  $M$  does the following:
  1.  $M$  takes  $w$  as input

# Closure of RE Languages under Kleene Star

- ▶ Suppose  $A$  is RE
- ▶ Let  $M_A$  recognize  $A$
- ▶ Create a machine  $M$  to recognize  $A^*$ .
- ▶  $M$  does the following:
  1.  $M$  takes  $w$  as input
  2. Try all possible ways of splitting up  $w = w_1w_2 \dots w_n$

# Closure of RE Languages under Kleene Star

- ▶ Suppose  $A$  is RE
- ▶ Let  $M_A$  recognize  $A$
- ▶ Create a machine  $M$  to recognize  $A^*$ .
- ▶  $M$  does the following:
  1.  $M$  takes  $w$  as input
  2. Try all possible ways of splitting up  $w = w_1 w_2 \dots w_n$ 
    - 2.1 For each way of splitting it up, run  $M_A$  on each  $w_i$

# Closure of RE Languages under Kleene Star

- ▶ Suppose  $A$  is RE
- ▶ Let  $M_A$  recognize  $A$
- ▶ Create a machine  $M$  to recognize  $A^*$ .
- ▶  $M$  does the following:
  1.  $M$  takes  $w$  as input
  2. Try all possible ways of splitting up  $w = w_1 w_2 \dots w_n$ 
    - 2.1 For each way of splitting it up, run  $M_A$  on each  $w_i$
    - 2.2 If  $M_A$  accepts each  $w_i$ , then  $M$  accepts

# Closure of RE Languages under Kleene Star

- ▶ Suppose  $A$  is RE
- ▶ Let  $M_A$  recognize  $A$
- ▶ Create a machine  $M$  to recognize  $A^*$ .
- ▶  $M$  does the following:
  1.  $M$  takes  $w$  as input
  2. Try all possible ways of splitting up  $w = w_1 w_2 \dots w_n$ 
    - 2.1 For each way of splitting it up, run  $M_A$  on each  $w_i$
    - 2.2 If  $M_A$  accepts each  $w_i$ , then  $M$  accepts
    - 2.3 Otherwise move on to the next way of splitting up  $w$



# Closure of RE Languages under Kleene Star

- ▶ Suppose  $A$  is RE
- ▶ Let  $M_A$  recognize  $A$
- ▶ Create a machine  $M$  to recognize  $A^*$ .
- ▶  $M$  does the following:
  1.  $M$  takes  $w$  as input
  2. Try all possible ways of splitting up  $w = w_1 w_2 \dots w_n$ 
    - 2.1 For each way of splitting it up, run  $M_A$  on each  $w_i$
    - 2.2 If  $M_A$  accepts each  $w_i$ , then  $M$  accepts
    - 2.3 Otherwise move on to the next way of splitting up  $w$
  3. If all splits are rejected, then  $M$  rejects

# Closure of RE Languages under Kleene Star

- ▶ Suppose  $A$  is RE
- ▶ Let  $M_A$  recognize  $A$
- ▶ Create a machine  $M$  to recognize  $A^*$ .
- ▶  $M$  does the following:
  1.  $M$  takes  $w$  as input
  2. Try all possible ways of splitting up  $w = w_1 w_2 \dots w_n$ 
    - 2.1 For each way of splitting it up, run  $M_A$  on each  $w_i$
    - 2.2 If  $M_A$  accepts each  $w_i$ , then  $M$  accepts
    - 2.3 Otherwise move on to the next way of splitting up  $w$
  3. If all splits are rejected, then  $M$  rejects

Will this work?

# Closure of RE Languages under Kleene Star

- ▶ Suppose  $A$  is RE
- ▶ Let  $M_A$  recognize  $A$
- ▶ Create a machine  $M$  to recognize  $A^*$ .
- ▶  $M$  does the following:
  1.  $M$  takes  $w$  as input
  2. Try all possible ways of splitting up  $w = w_1 w_2 \dots w_n$ 
    - 2.1 For each way of splitting it up, run  $M_A$  on each  $w_i$
    - 2.2 If  $M_A$  accepts each  $w_i$ , then  $M$  accepts
    - 2.3 ~~Otherwise move on to the next way of splitting up  $w$~~   
 $M_A$  may loop on some  $w_i$ , and we don't get to try other splits
  3. If all splits are rejected, then  $M$  rejects

Will this work?

# Closure of RE Languages under Kleene Star

- ▶ Suppose  $A$  is RE

# Closure of RE Languages under Kleene Star

- ▶ Suppose  $A$  is RE
- ▶ Let  $M_A$  recognize  $A$

# Closure of RE Languages under Kleene Star

- ▶ Suppose  $A$  is RE
- ▶ Let  $M_A$  recognize  $A$
- ▶ Create a machine  $M$  to recognize  $A^*$ .

# Closure of RE Languages under Kleene Star

- ▶ Suppose  $A$  is RE
- ▶ Let  $M_A$  recognize  $A$
- ▶ Create a machine  $M$  to recognize  $A^*$ .
- ▶  $M$  does the following:

# Closure of RE Languages under Kleene Star

- ▶ Suppose  $A$  is RE
- ▶ Let  $M_A$  recognize  $A$
- ▶ Create a machine  $M$  to recognize  $A^*$ .
- ▶  $M$  does the following:
  1.  $M$  takes  $w$  as input



# Closure of RE Languages under Kleene Star

- ▶ Suppose  $A$  is RE
- ▶ Let  $M_A$  recognize  $A$
- ▶ Create a machine  $M$  to recognize  $A^*$ .
- ▶  $M$  does the following:
  1.  $M$  takes  $w$  as input
  2. Try all possible ways of splitting up  $w = w_1w_2 \dots w_n$  in parallel

# Closure of RE Languages under Kleene Star

- ▶ Suppose  $A$  is RE
- ▶ Let  $M_A$  recognize  $A$
- ▶ Create a machine  $M$  to recognize  $A^*$ .
- ▶  $M$  does the following:
  1.  $M$  takes  $w$  as input
  2. Try all possible ways of splitting up  $w = w_1 w_2 \dots w_n$  in parallel
    - 2.1 For each way of splitting it up, run  $M_A$  on each  $w_i$  in parallel.

# Closure of RE Languages under Kleene Star

- ▶ Suppose  $A$  is RE
- ▶ Let  $M_A$  recognize  $A$
- ▶ Create a machine  $M$  to recognize  $A^*$ .
- ▶  $M$  does the following:
  1.  $M$  takes  $w$  as input
  2. Try all possible ways of splitting up  $w = w_1 w_2 \dots w_n$  in parallel
    - 2.1 For each way of splitting it up, run  $M_A$  on each  $w_i$  in parallel.
  3. If  $M_A$  accepts each  $w_i$  for any split, then  $M$  accepts

# Closure of RE Languages under Kleene Star

- ▶ Suppose  $A$  is RE
- ▶ Let  $M_A$  recognize  $A$
- ▶ Create a machine  $M$  to recognize  $A^*$ .
- ▶  $M$  does the following:
  1.  $M$  takes  $w$  as input
  2. Try all possible ways of splitting up  $w = w_1 w_2 \dots w_n$  in parallel
    - 2.1 For each way of splitting it up, run  $M_A$  on each  $w_i$  in parallel.
  3. If  $M_A$  accepts each  $w_i$  for any split, then  $M$  accepts
  4. If every way of splitting up  $w$  fails,  $M$  may loop, but that's ok

# Closure Properties of Turing Machines

- ▶ Suppose  $A$  is RE

# Closure Properties of Turing Machines

- ▶ Suppose  $A$  is RE
- ▶ Let  $M_A$  recognize  $A$

# Closure Properties of Turing Machines

- ▶ Suppose  $A$  is RE
- ▶ Let  $M_A$  recognize  $A$
- ▶ Create a nondeterministic machine  $M$  to recognize  $A^*$  as follows:

# Closure Properties of Turing Machines

- ▶ Suppose  $A$  is RE
- ▶ Let  $M_A$  recognize  $A$
- ▶ Create a nondeterministic machine  $M$  to recognize  $A^*$  as follows:
  1.  $M$  takes  $w$  as input



# Closure Properties of Turing Machines

- ▶ Suppose  $A$  is RE
- ▶ Let  $M_A$  recognize  $A$
- ▶ Create a nondeterministic machine  $M$  to recognize  $A^*$  as follows:
  1.  $M$  takes  $w$  as input
  2. Nondeterministically guess how to split up  $w = w_1 w_2 \dots w_n$

# Closure Properties of Turing Machines

- ▶ Suppose  $A$  is RE
- ▶ Let  $M_A$  recognize  $A$
- ▶ Create a nondeterministic machine  $M$  to recognize  $A^*$  as follows:
  1.  $M$  takes  $w$  as input
  2. Nondeterministically guess how to split up  $w = w_1 w_2 \dots w_n$
  3. Run  $M_A$  on each  $w_i$  in parallel

# Closure Properties of Turing Machines

- ▶ Suppose  $A$  is RE
- ▶ Let  $M_A$  recognize  $A$
- ▶ Create a nondeterministic machine  $M$  to recognize  $A^*$  as follows:
  1.  $M$  takes  $w$  as input
  2. Nondeterministically guess how to split up  $w = w_1 w_2 \dots w_n$
  3. Run  $M_A$  on each  $w_i$  in parallel
  4. If  $M_A$  accepts each  $w_i$  (i.e. we guessed correctly) then  $M$  accepts

# Closure Properties of Turing Machines

- ▶ Suppose  $A$  is RE
- ▶ Let  $M_A$  recognize  $A$
- ▶ Create a nondeterministic machine  $M$  to recognize  $A^*$  as follows:
  1.  $M$  takes  $w$  as input
  2. Nondeterministically guess how to split up  $w = w_1 w_2 \dots w_n$
  3. Run  $M_A$  on each  $w_i$  in parallel
  4. If  $M_A$  accepts each  $w_i$  (i.e. we guessed correctly) then  $M$  accepts
- ▶ Every nondeterministic TM can be converted to a deterministic TM

# Closure Properties of Turing Machines

- ▶ Prove that decidable languages are closed under complement
- ▶ Prove that RE languages are closed under complement

# Closure of Decidable Languages under Complement

- ▶ Suppose  $A$  is decidable

# Closure of Decidable Languages under Complement

- ▶ Suppose  $A$  is decidable
- ▶ Let  $M_A$  decide  $A$

# Closure of Decidable Languages under Complement

- ▶ Suppose  $A$  is decidable
- ▶ Let  $M_A$  decide  $A$
- ▶ Create a machine  $M$  to decide  $A^c$



# Closure of Decidable Languages under Complement

- ▶ Suppose  $A$  is decidable
- ▶ Let  $M_A$  decide  $A$
- ▶ Create a machine  $M$  to decide  $A^c$
- ▶  $M$  does the following:

# Closure of Decidable Languages under Complement

- ▶ Suppose  $A$  is decidable
- ▶ Let  $M_A$  decide  $A$
- ▶ Create a machine  $M$  to decide  $A^c$
- ▶  $M$  does the following:
  1.  $M$  takes  $w$  as input

# Closure of Decidable Languages under Complement

- ▶ Suppose  $A$  is decidable
- ▶ Let  $M_A$  decide  $A$
- ▶ Create a machine  $M$  to decide  $A^c$
- ▶  $M$  does the following:
  1.  $M$  takes  $w$  as input
  2. Run  $M_A$  on  $w$

# Closure of Decidable Languages under Complement

- ▶ Suppose  $A$  is decidable
- ▶ Let  $M_A$  decide  $A$
- ▶ Create a machine  $M$  to decide  $A^c$
- ▶  $M$  does the following:
  1.  $M$  takes  $w$  as input
  2. Run  $M_A$  on  $w$
  3. If  $M_A$  accepts,  $M$  rejects

# Closure of Decidable Languages under Complement

- ▶ Suppose  $A$  is decidable
- ▶ Let  $M_A$  decide  $A$
- ▶ Create a machine  $M$  to decide  $A^c$
- ▶  $M$  does the following:
  1.  $M$  takes  $w$  as input
  2. Run  $M_A$  on  $w$
  3. If  $M_A$  accepts,  $M$  rejects
  4. If  $M_A$  rejects,  $M$  accepts

# Closure of Decidable Languages under Complement

- ▶ Suppose  $A$  is decidable
- ▶ Let  $M_A$  decide  $A$
- ▶ Create a machine  $M$  to decide  $A^c$
- ▶  $M$  does the following:
  1.  $M$  takes  $w$  as input
  2. Run  $M_A$  on  $w$
  3. If  $M_A$  accepts,  $M$  rejects
  4. If  $M_A$  rejects,  $M$  accepts
- ▶  $M_A$  always halts, so  $M$  always halts

# Closure of Decidable Languages under Complement

- ▶ Suppose  $A$  is decidable
- ▶ Let  $M_A$  decide  $A$
- ▶ Create a machine  $M$  to decide  $A^c$
- ▶  $M$  does the following:
  1.  $M$  takes  $w$  as input
  2. Run  $M_A$  on  $w$
  3. If  $M_A$  accepts,  $M$  rejects
  4. If  $M_A$  rejects,  $M$  accepts
- ▶  $M_A$  always halts, so  $M$  always halts
- ▶  $M$  accepts  $w \Leftrightarrow M_A$  rejects  $w \Leftrightarrow w \notin A$

# Closure of RE Languages under Complement

- ▶ Suppose  $A$  is RE



# Closure of RE Languages under Complement

- ▶ Suppose  $A$  is RE
- ▶ Let  $M_A$  recognize  $A$

# Closure of RE Languages under Complement

- ▶ Suppose  $A$  is RE
- ▶ Let  $M_A$  recognize  $A$
- ▶ Create a machine  $M$  to recognize  $A^c$ .

# Closure of RE Languages under Complement

- ▶ Suppose  $A$  is RE
- ▶ Let  $M_A$  recognize  $A$
- ▶ Create a machine  $M$  to recognize  $A^c$ .
- ▶  $M$  does the following:

# Closure of RE Languages under Complement

- ▶ Suppose  $A$  is RE
- ▶ Let  $M_A$  recognize  $A$
- ▶ Create a machine  $M$  to recognize  $A^c$ .
- ▶  $M$  does the following:
  1.  $M$  takes  $w$  as input

# Closure of RE Languages under Complement

- ▶ Suppose  $A$  is RE
- ▶ Let  $M_A$  recognize  $A$
- ▶ Create a machine  $M$  to recognize  $A^c$ .
- ▶  $M$  does the following:
  1.  $M$  takes  $w$  as input
  2. Run  $M_A$  on  $w$

# Closure of RE Languages under Complement

- ▶ Suppose  $A$  is RE
- ▶ Let  $M_A$  recognize  $A$
- ▶ Create a machine  $M$  to recognize  $A^c$ .
- ▶  $M$  does the following:
  1.  $M$  takes  $w$  as input
  2. Run  $M_A$  on  $w$
  3. If  $M_A$  accepts,  $M$  rejects

# Closure of RE Languages under Complement

- ▶ Suppose  $A$  is RE
- ▶ Let  $M_A$  recognize  $A$
- ▶ Create a machine  $M$  to recognize  $A^c$ .
- ▶  $M$  does the following:
  1.  $M$  takes  $w$  as input
  2. Run  $M_A$  on  $w$
  3. If  $M_A$  accepts,  $M$  rejects
  4. If  $M_A$  rejects,  $M$  accepts

# Closure of RE Languages under Complement

- ▶ Suppose  $A$  is RE
- ▶ Let  $M_A$  recognize  $A$
- ▶ Create a machine  $M$  to recognize  $A^c$ .
- ▶  $M$  does the following:
  1.  $M$  takes  $w$  as input
  2. Run  $M_A$  on  $w$
  3. If  $M_A$  accepts,  $M$  rejects
  4. If  $M_A$  rejects,  $M$  accepts

Will this work?



# Closure of RE Languages under Complement

- ▶ Suppose  $A$  is RE
- ▶ Let  $M_A$  recognize  $A$
- ▶ Create a machine  $M$  to recognize  $A^c$ .
- ▶  $M$  does the following:
  1.  $M$  takes  $w$  as input
  2. Run  $M_A$  on  $w$
  3. If  $M_A$  accepts,  $M$  rejects
  4. If  $M_A$  rejects,  $M$  accepts
  5. If  $M_A$  loops, then  $M$  loops

Will this work?

# Closure of RE Languages under Complement

- ▶ Suppose  $A$  is RE
- ▶ Let  $M_A$  recognize  $A$
- ▶ Create a machine  $M$  to recognize  $A^c$ .
- ▶  $M$  does the following:
  1.  $M$  takes  $w$  as input
  2. Run  $M_A$  on  $w$
  3. If  $M_A$  accepts,  $M$  rejects
  4. If  $M_A$  rejects,  $M$  accepts
  5. If  $M_A$  loops, then  $M$  loops
- ▶  $M$  may not accept strings that are part of  $A^c$

Will this work?

Closure  
Completion



Will



Ac

# Closure of RE Languages under Complement

- ▶ As it turns out, RE languages are NOT closed under complement.

# Closure of RE Languages under Complement

- ▶ As it turns out, RE languages are NOT closed under complement.
- ▶ We will study techniques to prove such statements next week.

# Closure Properties of Turing Machines

Recap

# Closure Properties of Turing Machines

## Recap

- ▶ Decidable languages are closed under union, intersection, complement, Kleene star

# Closure Properties of Turing Machines

## Recap

- ▶ Decidable languages are closed under union, intersection, complement, Kleene star
- ▶ RE languages are closed under union, intersection, Kleene star



# Closure Properties of Turing Machines

## Recap

- ▶ Decidable languages are closed under union, intersection, complement, Kleene star
- ▶ RE languages are closed under union, intersection, Kleene star
  - ▶ We need to be careful and run machines/computation paths in parallel

# Closure Properties of Turing Machines

## Recap

- ▶ Decidable languages are closed under union, intersection, complement, Kleene star
- ▶ RE languages are closed under union, intersection, Kleene star
  - ▶ We need to be careful and run machines/computation paths in parallel
- ▶ RE languages are not closed under complement